April 21, 2009

Mary D. Nichols, Chairman California Air Resources Board Headquarters Building 1001 "T" Street Sacramento, CA 95812

Dear Chairman Nichols,

As scientists and economists with relevant expertise, we are writing to recommend that you include indirect land use change in the lifecycle analyses of heat-trapping emissions from biofuels and other transportation fuels. This policy will encourage development of sustainable, low-carbon fuels that avoid conflict with food and minimize harmful environmental impacts.

Our comments are relevant to the development of California's Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS), which the Air Resources Board (ARB) will consider for adoption in its April hearing, as well as other policies that evaluate lifecycle heat-trapping emissions from biofuels. For policies like the LCFS to successfully reduce GHG emissions, it is critical to include all major sources of emissions, including indirect land use emissions from biofuels.

We encourage you to investigate and include significant direct and indirect emissions from all fuels, including conventional petroleum, heavy oils, natural gas for transportation, oil sand-based fuels, and the range of fuels used to power electrified transportation, consistent with the best available science. However, you should not delay inclusion of known sources of emissions, including indirect emissions from biofuels, pending discovery of potential effects from other fuels.

Recent peer-reviewed research indicates that conventional biofuels can directly or indirectly result in substantial heat-trapping emissions through the conversion of forests and grasslands to croplands to accommodate biofuel production. Increased demand for crops to make fuel results in higher global commodity prices that can induce farmers in other countries to plow up sensitive, high-carbon ecosystems—including rain forests in South America and Southeast Asia. Previous lifecycle analyses did not adequately account for these emissions, giving biofuels credit for greater carbon savings than actually achieved.

There are uncertainties inherent in estimating the magnitude of indirect land use emissions from biofuels, but assigning a value of zero is clearly not supported by the science. The data on land use change indicate that the emissions related to biofuels are significant and can be quite large. Grappling with the technical uncertainty and developing a regulation based on the best available science is preferable to ignoring a major source of emissions. Over time, greater accuracy and detail in a more refined analysis can be reflected in future LCFS rulemakings.

The need to address uncertainties applies to other areas the analysis as well, and we urge you to evaluate the increasing use of nitrogen fertilizers and herbicides associated with greater biofuel production. In particular, nitrogen fertilizers enhance the emission of nitrous oxide—a powerful greenhouse gas in Earth's atmosphere.

To spur innovation in low carbon fuels, the LCFS must send an accurate signal to the growing clean energy market. Strategic investment decisions should be based upon the best available data of the carbon footprint of alternative fuels. Failure to include a major source of pollution, like indirect land use emissions, will distort the carbon market, suppress investment in truly low carbon fuels, and ultimately result in higher emissions.

The work you are doing in California sets an important precedent for transportation fuel policy nationally and internationally, as well as for action to confront climate change more broadly. We urge you to ensure that your policies are based on the best science, including consideration of emissions from indirect changes in land use.

Sincerely,

- Original Authors -

PAM MATSON, Ph.D.

Chester Naramore Dean of the School of Earth Sciences Richard and Rhoda Goldman Professor of Environmental Studies Stanford University Stanford, CA Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

STUART L. PIMM, Ph.D.

Doris Duke Professor of Conservation Ecology Nicholas School of the Environment and Earth Sciences Duke University Durham, NC

WILLIAM SCHLESINGER, Ph.D.

President
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies
Millbrook, NY
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

PETER C. FRUMHOFF, Ph.D. Director of Science and Policy Chief Scientist, Climate Campaign Union of Concerned Scientists Cambridge, MA

W. MICHAEL HANEMANN, Ph.D. Chancellor's Professor Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

Organizational affiliations are for identification purposes only.

KENNETH ARROW, Ph.D.

Palo Alto, CA

Nobel Laureate, Economics

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

Recipient of the United States National Medal of Science

FRANK WILCZEK, Ph.D.

Herman Feshbach Professor of Physics

Physics

Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Cambridge, MA

Nobel Laureate, Physics

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

MacArthur Fellow

F. CHAPIN, III, Ph.D.

Professor of Ecology Institute of Arctic Biology University of Alaska Fairbanks

Fairbanks, AK

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

WILLIAM CLARK, Ph.D.

Professor

Kennedy School of Government

Harvard University Cambridge, MA

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

MacArthur Fellow

DAVID GIBSON, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus University of Iowa

Iowa City, IA

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

RICHARD HOUGHTON, Ph.D.

Acting Director

Woods Hole Research Center

Falmouth, MA

ROBERT KATES, Ph.D.

Trenton, ME

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

MacArthur Fellow

THOMAS E. LOVEJOY, Ph.D.

Heinz Center Biodiversity Chair

The H. John Heinz III Center for Science, Economics and

the Environment

Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

MICHAEL O'HARE, Ph.D.

Professor of Public Policy

Goldman School of Public Policy

University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

RICHARD AMBROSE, Ph.D.

Professor

Environmental Health Sciences University of California, Los Angeles

Los Angeles, CA

Mills College

Oakland, CA

JASMIN ANSAR, Ph.D.

Visiting Assistant Professor

Lorry Lokey Business School

BEVIN ASHENMILLER, Ph.D. Assistant Professor of Economics

Economics Occidental College

Los Angeles, CA

DENNIS BALDOCCHI, Ph.D. Professor of Biometeorology Environmental Science Policy and

Management

University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

LOWELL ASHBAUGH, Ph.D.

Project Scientist

Crocker Nuclear Laboratory University of California, Davis

Davis, CA

EDWARD BARBIER, Ph.D.

John S. Bugas Professor of Economics

Economics and Finance University of Wyoming

Laramie, WY

PETER BAYLEY, Ph.D.

Fisheries and Wildlife Department The Ohio State University

Corvallis, OR

KENNETH BERGMAN, Ph.D.

National Aeronautics and Space

Administration (retired)

Earth Sciences

Ashland, OR

DONALD BOESCH, Ph.D.

President

University of Maryland, Center for

Environmental Science

Cambridge, MD

SEVERIN BORENSTEIN, Ph.D.

Professor

Haas School and University of California Energy Institute

University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

CHARLES BOYCE, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

University of Chicago Chicago, IL

GUY BRASSEUR, Ph.D.

Earth and Sun Systems Laboratory National Center for Atmospheric

Research Boulder, CO

HOLGER BRIX, Ph.D.

Assistant Researcher

Atmospheric and Oceanic Sciences University of California, Los Angeles

Los Angeles, CA

PETER BRUSSARD, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus

Biology

University of Nevada

Reno, NV

HAROLD BURSTYN, Ph.D.

Electrical Engineering and Computer

Science

Syracuse University

Syracuse, NY

CHRISTOPHER BUSCH, Ph.D.

Economist

Policy Director

Center for Resource Solutions

JOHN CAMPBELL, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

College of Engineering

University of California, Merced

Merced, CA

PETER CHESSON, Ph.D.

Professor

Ecology and Evolutionary Biology

University of Arizona

Tucson, AZ

ROBERT CIFELLI, Ph.D.

Senior Research Scientist

Atmospheric Science Colorado State University

Fort Collins, CO

RAYMOND CLARKE, Ph.D.

Biology

Sarah Lawrence College

Bronxville, NY

DANIEL COLBERT, Ph.D.

Executive Director

Institute for Energy Efficiency

University of California, Santa Barbara

Santa Barbara, CA

ALAN CUNNINGHAM, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus

Chemistry

Monterey Peninsula College (retired)

Carmel Valley, CA

MARIA DAMON, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Daniel J. Evans School of Public Affairs

University of Washington

Seattle, WA

ERIC DAVIDSON, Ph.D.

Senior Scientist

The Woods Hole Research Center

Falmouth, MA

PETER DORMAN, Ph.D.

The Evergreen State College

Olympia, WA

ELLEN DOUGLAS, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Department of Environmental, Earth and

Ocean Sciences

University of Massachusetts Boston

Boston, MA

HADI DOWLATABADI, Ph. D.

Canada Research Chair

Professor of Applied Mathematics and

Global Change Institute for Resources Environment and

Sustainability

Liu Institute for Global Issues

The University of British Columbia

Vancouve, BC

AMY DUNHAM, Ph.D.

Research Faculty

Ecology and Evolutionary Biology

Rice University

Houston, TX

HALLIE EAKIN, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

School of Sustainability

Arizona State University

Tempe, AZ

BRENDA EKWURZEL, Ph.D.

Climate Scientist

Climate Program

Union of Concerned Scientists

Washington, DC

Y. FARZIN, Ph.D.

Professor

Agricultural and Resource Economics

University of California, Davis

Davis, CA

TRACY FELDMAN, Ph.D.

Postdoctoral Associate

Biology

University of Wisconsin - Stevens Point

Stevens Point, WI

PAUL FERRARO, Ph.D.

Associate Professor of Economics

Department of Economics

Georgia State University

Atlanta, GA

MELANIE FITZPATRICK, Ph.D.

Climate Scientist

Climate Program

Union of Concerned Scientists

Cambridge, MA

ALLISON FLEGE, Ph.D.

Adjunct Assistant Professor

Geography

University of Cincinnati

Cincinnati, OH

JOHANNES FOUFOPOULOS, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

School of Natural Resources

University of Michigan

Ann Arbor, MI

ROBERT GAMACHE, Ph.D.

Professor

Environmental, Earth, and Atmospheric

Science University of Massachusetts Lowell Lowell, MA

CATHERINE GAUTIER, Ph.D.

Professor

Geography

University of California, Santa Barbara

Santa Barbara, CA

BART GEERTS, Ph.D.

Associate Professor

Atmospheric Science

University of Wyoming Laramie, WY

KAREN GLENNEMEIER, Ph.D. Science Director Audubon-Chicago Region

Evanston, IL

DAVID GORCHOV, Ph.D.

Professor Botany Miami University Oxford, OH

W. GRIFFIN, Ph.D.

Executive Director, Green Design Institute Tepper School of Business Carnegie Mellon University

Pittsburgh, PA

MARTHA GROOM, Ph.D.

Associate Professor of Conservation Biology Interdisciplinary Arts and Sciences University of Washington Bothell Bothell, WA

THEODORE GROVES, Ph.D.

Professor of Economics Economics University of California, San Diego La Jolla, CA

HOSHIN GUPTA, Ph.D.

Professor Hydrology and Water Resources University of Arizona Tucson, AZ

DOUG GURIAN-SHERMAN, Ph.D.

Senior Scientist Food and Environment Program Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

M. ROBERT HAMERSLEY, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor of Environmental Microbiology Environmental Studies Soka University of America Aliso Viejo, CA

DENNIS HANSELL, Ph.D.

Professor Marine and Atmospheric Chemistry University of Miami Miami, FL

JOHN HARTE, Ph.D.

Professor Energy and Resources Group University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA EVAN HAZARD, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus Biology Bemidji State University

Bemidji, MN

MARK HIXON, Ph.D. Helen Thompson Professor

Department of Zoology Oregon State University Corvallis, OR

KAREN HOLL, Ph.D.

Professor Environmental Studies

University of California, Santa Cruz

Santa Cruz, CA

ROBERT HOWARTH, Ph.D.

David Atkinson Professor of Ecology Ecology & Evolutionary Biology

Cornell University Ithaca, NY

DAVID INOUYE, Ph.D.

Professor Biology University of Maryland College Park, MD

STEPHEN JACKSON, Ph.D.

Professor of Botany and Ecology Botany

University of Wyoming

Laramie, WY

MILIND KANDLIKAR, Ph.D.

University of British Columbia Liu Institute for Global Issues

Vancouver, BC

JAMES KASTING, Ph.D.

Distinguished Professor of Geosciences

Geosciences

Pennsylvania State University

University Park, PA

ANDY KEELER, Ph.D.

Associate Professor of Public Policy John Glenn School of Public Affairs The Ohio State University

Columbus, OH

ARTURO KELLER, Ph.D.

Bren School of Environmental Science &

Management

University of California, Santa Barbara

Santa Barbara, CA

ALISSA KENDALL, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Civil and Environmental Engineering

University of California, Davis

Davis, CA

KENNETH KIMBALL, Ph.D.

Director of Research

Research

Appalachian Mountain Club

Gorham, NH

CHRISTOPHER KNITTEL, Ph.D.

Associate Profess and Chancellor's Fellow

Economics

University of California, Davis

Davis, CA

NIR KRAKAUER, Ph.D.

Department of Civil Engineering City University of New York

New York, NY

DAVID LEAHY, Ph.D.

Research Scientist

Chemistry

Stanford University

Stanford, CA

SHERMAN LEWIS, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus

Political Science California State University Hayward

Hayward, CA

WILLIAM LIDICKER, Ph.D.

Professor of Integrative Biology Emeritus

Integrative Biology

University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

TIMOTHY LIPMAN, Ph.D.

Co-Director

Transportation Sustainability Research

Center

Institute of Transportation Studies University of California, Berkeley

Richmond, CA

LESTER LIPSKY, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus

Conputer Science and Engineering

University of Connecticut

Storrs, CT

CREIGHTON LITTON, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor, Forest Ecology

Natural Resources and Environmental

Management

University of Hawaii

Honolulu, HI

RAINER LOHMANN, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Graduate School of Oceanography

University of Rhode Island

Narragansett, RI

JOHN LORAND, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus

Chemistry

Central Michigan University

Mt. Pleasant, MI

STEPHEN MANNING, Ph.D.

Professor of Biology

Biology

Arkansas State University - Beebe

Beebe, AR

PETRUS MARTENS, Ph.D.

Astrophysicist

Smithsonian Astrophysical Observatory

Cambridge, MA

JEREMY MARTIN, Ph.D.

Senior Scientist

Clean Vehicles

Union of Concerned Scientists

Washington, DC

MICHAEL MCCORMICK, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Biology

Hamilton College

Clinton, NY

MARGARET MELLON, Ph.D.

Senior Scientist and Director Food and Environment Program

Union of Concerned Scientists

Washington, DC

ZEWEI MIAO, Ph.D.

Research Associate

Energy Biosciences Institute

University of Illinois

Urbana, IL

DAVID MITCHELL, Ph.D.

Associate Research Professor

Division of Atmospheric Sciences

Desert Research Institute

Reno, NV

RONALD MITCHELL, Ph.D.

Professor Political Science

University of Oregon

Eugene, OR

DAVID MODARELLI, Ph.D.

Professor

Chemistry University of Akron

Akron, OH

WILLIAM MOOMAW, Ph.D.

Professor

Center for International Environment and

Resource Policy Tufts University

Medford, MA

K. MURRAY, Ph.D. Professor of Biology

Professor of blok

Biology

Hope College

Holland, MI

RONI NEFF, Ph.D.

Research Associate

Environmental Health Sciences

Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of

Public Health Baltimore, MD

CHARLES NELSON, Ph.D.

Professor of Physics

Physics

State University of New York

Binghamton, NY

JOHN NIELSEN-GAMMON, Ph.D.

Professor

Atmospheric Sciences Texas A&M University

College Station, TX

RICHARD NORGAARD, Ph.D.

Professor of Energy and Resources

University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

GRETCHEN NORTH, Ph.D.

Associate Professor

Biology

Occidental College

Los Angeles, CA

REED NOSS, Ph.D.

Davis-Shine Distinguished Professor

Biology

University of Central Florida

Orlando, FL

MICHAEL PALMER, Ph.D.

Regents Professor

Botany

Oklahoma State University

Stillwater, OK

MARTIN POLZ, Ph.D.

Professor

Civil and Environmental Engineering Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Cambridge, MA

R. RAU, Ph.D.

Physics

Brookhaven National Laboratory (retired)

Bellport, NY

DOROTHY READ, Ph.D.

Professor Emerita

Biology

University of Massachusetts Dartmouth

Dartmouth, MA

MICHAEL REICH, Ph.D.

Professor

Economics

University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

PETER REYNOLDS, Ph.D.

Adjunct Professor

Physics

North Carolina State University

Raleigh, NC

JANE RISSLER, Ph.D.

Senior Scientist and Deputy Director

Food and Environment Program

Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

GEORGE ROBINSON, Ph.D.

Professor

Biological Sciences

University at Albany,

State University of New York Albany, NY

DIANNE ROCHELEAU, Ph.D.

Associate Professor

Geography

Clark University Worcester, MA

JEFF ROMM, Ph.D.

Professor

Environmental Science, Policy and

Management

University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

THOMAS ROONEY, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor Biological Sciences

Wright State University Dayton, OH JULIETTE ROONEY-VARGA, Ph.D.

Associate Professor Biological Sciences

University of Massachusetts Lowell

Lowell, MA

ARMIN ROSENCRANZ, Ph.D.

Visiting Professor

Johns Hopkins School of Advanced

International Studies Washington, DC

VOLKER RUDOLF, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Ecology and Evolutionary Biology

Rice University

Houston, TX

PATRICK RYAN, Ph.D.

Professor

Arts and Sciences

Johnson & Wales University

Denver, CO

ROBERT SANFORD, Ph.D.

Professor

Biological Sciences

University of Denver

Denver, CO

KAY SCHEETS, Ph.D.

Adjunct Assistant Professor

Botany

Oklahoma State University

Stillwater, OK

DAVID SCHIMEL, Ph.D.

Chief Executive Officer

National Ecological Observatory Network

Boulder, CO

LEE SCHIPPER, Ph.D.

Senior Research Engineer

Precourt Energy Efficiency Center

Stanford University

Stanford, CA

KURT SCHWABE, Ph.D.

Associate Professor

Environmental Sciences

University of California, Riverside

Riverside, CA

JASON SCORSE, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Monterey Institute of International

Studies

Monterey, CA

THOMAS SHERRY, Ph.D.

Professor

Ecology and Evolutionary Biology

Tulane University

New Orleans, LA

JACK SITES, JR., Ph.D.

Professor and Curator

Biology

Brigham Young University

Provo, UT

JOHAN SIX, Ph.D.

Plant Sciences

University of California, Davis

Davis, CA

LOWELL SMITH, Ph.D.

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(retired)

Berryville, VA

DANIELA SOLERI, Ph.D.

Geography

University of California, Santa Barbara

Santa Barbara, CA

ROGER SPARKS, Ph.D.

Professor of Economics

Economics

Mills College

Oakland, CA

SABRINA SPATARI, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Civil, Architectural and Environmental

Engineering

Drexel University

Philadelphia, PA

THOMAS SPIRO, Ph.D.

Professor

Chemistry

University of Washington

Seattle, WA

THOMAS STRUHSAKER, Ph.D.

Evolutionary Anthropology

Duke University

Durham, NC

THOMAS TIETENBERG, Ph.D. Mitchell Family Professor of Economics

Emeritus

Economics

Colby College

Waterville, ME

ROBERT TURNER, Ph.D.

Professor

Economics and Environmental Studies

Colgate University

Hamilton, NY

MATHIAS VAN THIEL, Ph.D.

Physical Chemist

Physics and Space Technology

Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

(retired)

Hayward, CA

ASHWANI VASISHTH, Ph.D.

Director

Institute for Sustainability

California State University, Northridge

Northridge, CA

JEFFREY VINCENT, Ph.D.

Korstian Professor of Forest Economics

and Management

Nicholas School of the Environment

Duke University

Durham, NC

BRIAN VON HERZEN, Ph.D.

Executive Director

The Climate Foundation

Beaverton, OR

BETSY VON HOLLE, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Biology

University of Central Florida

Orlando, FL

RICHARD WALKER, Ph.D.

Professor

Geography University of California, Berkeley

Berkeley, CA

LINDA WALLACE, Ph.D.

Botany/Microbiology

University of Oklahoma

Norman, OK

DONALD WALLER, Ph.D. Professor of Botany and Environmental

Studies

Botany

University of Wisconsin-Madison

Madison, WI

ZHI WANG, Ph.D.

Associate Professor Earth and Environmental Sciences

California State University, Fresno

Fresno, CA

CHRISTOPHER WEBER, Ph.D.

Assistant Research Professor

Civil and Environmental Engineering

Carnegie Mellon University

Pittsburgh, PA

RAY WEISS, Ph.D. SONIA YEH, Ph.D. VINCENT GUTSCHICK, Ph.D. Distinguished Professor Research Engineer Las Cruces, NM

Scripps Institution of Oceanography The Institute of Transportation Studies University of California, San Diego University of California, Davis

La Jolla, CA HAROLD HARRIS, Ph.D. Davis, CA St. Louis, MO

MICHAEL WEISSMAN, Ph.D. THOMAS YUILL, Ph.D.

GRAINGER HUNT, Ph.D. Professor of Physics Professor and Director Emeritus

Physics Nelson Institute for Environmental Boise, ID University of Illinois at Urbana-Studies

University of Wisconsin-Madison Champaign

Urbanna, IL Madison, WI DOUG LAFOLLETTE, Ph.D. Madison, WI

STEPHEN WIEL, Ph.D. HISHAM ZERRIFFI, Ph.D. JUDITH LANG, Ph.D.

Ivan Head South/North Research Chair President of the Board Ophelia, VA Center for Law and Social Policy (CLASP) Liu Institute for Global Issues

Washington, DC University of British Columbia KRISTIN LEWIS, Ph.D. Vancouver, BC

Cambridge, MA ROBLEY WILLIAMS, Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus SIMONE ALIN, Ph.D. Biological Sciences Seattle, WA ROBERT MASON, Ph.D.

Vanderbilt University Philadelphia, PA Nashville, TN

MATTHEW AUER, Ph.D. Bloomington, IN MOLLY MCMUIRE, Ph.D.

WILLIAM WILLIAMS, Ph.D. Lewisburg, PA Professor

JEDEDIAH BRODIE, Ph.D. Biology St. Mary's College of Maryland Missoula, MT KIRK MOLONEY, Ph.D.

Saint Marys City, MD Ames, IA

CLIFFORD BUNTON, Ph.D. HOWARD WILSHIRE, Ph.D. Santa Barbara, CA STEPHEN MUDRICK, Ph.D.

Research Geologist Columbia, MO U.S. Geological Survey (retired)

DAVID CAMPBELL, Ph.D. Sebastopol, CA Tuscaloosa, AL SIOBHAN REILLY, Ph.D.

Oakland, CA HENDRIK WOLFF, Ph.D.

MARK CHANDLER, Ph.D. Madison, WI JEFFREY STIBICK, Ph.D. University of Washington Riverdale, MD Seattle, WA

BRUCE COLLETTE, Ph.D.

COLIN WRAIGHT, Ph.D. CARLYLE STORM, Ph.D. Washington, DC Professor and Head Kingston, RI Biochemistry

JOHN COOPER, Ph.D. University of Illinois Urbana, IL Lewisburg, PA CLAUDIA TEBALDI, Ph.D.

Princeton, NJ

CHRIS FOREST, Ph.D. MAIKEN WINTER, Ph.D. University Park, PA Ithaca, NY

Organizational affiliations are for identification purposes only.

cc. Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger

Lisa P. Jackson, Administrator, US-Environmental Protection Agency

Linda Adams, Secretary, Cal-EPA

Economics

Mike Scheible, Deputy Director, Air Resources Board

Karen Douglas, Commissioner, California Energy Commission

David Crane, Special Advisor for Jobs & Economic Growth, Office of Governor Schwarzenegger